

Dear Dr. Petit, dear Dr. Olvera-Vazquez,

I have reviewed the second version of the manuscript “Experimental test for local adaptation of the rosy apple aphid (*Dysaphis plantaginea*) to its host (*Malus domestica*) and to its climate in Europe.” and the authors have satisfyingly answered to every points I rose in the first round of review. The first version of this protocol was already well-thought and detailed and this revised version appears clearer and more robust. Pitfall in the data analysis plan have also been addressed. The pre-registration for this experiment seems suited for a recommendation by PCI Ecology. The experiment appears very promising and I look forward to see the results!